SITUATIONAL BRIEF: COVID-19 AND ASSOCIATED RISKS FOR CENTRAL ASIAN TEMPORARY LABOUR MIGRANTS IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Authors: Elizabeth J. King, PhD, MPH¹ and Natalia Zotova, PhD²

CONTEXT OF TEMPORARY LABOUR MIGRANTS FROM CENTRAL ASIA IN RUSSIA

The Russian Federation continues to be a major destination country for Central Asian labour migrants¹. There were nearly 5 million Central Asians living in the Russian Federation in 2019², mainly coming from Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan in order to seek employment opportunities. Men continue to make up the majority of Central Asian migrants in Russia, but the number of women is increasing³. The Moscow metropolitan area attracts the largest number of Central Asian migrants, but their destinations also include other large cities across Russia⁴. Central Asian labour migrants are a largely vulnerable population in Russia, with some of the major difficulties including precarious legal status, economic vulnerabilities, ethnic and racial discrimination, and inaccessible healthcare services. Russia's immigration laws are complex and subject to frequent changes^{5,6}. Bureaucracy and high costs explain why many (estimated to be up to 2/3) Central Asian migrants have irregular legal status (e.g., lacking residential registration and/or work permit) and therefore are often more marginalized and exploited by their employers and law enforcement officials⁷. Legal precarity and discrimination affect migrants' daily lives and hinder their access to resources including health care^{8,9}. Central Asians are prone to ethnoracially-based harassment^{10,11}. Limited Russian language proficiency can add to migrants' economic and legal marginalization¹² and serve as a barrier to healthcare service utilization¹³. Social exclusion and discrimination constrain some Central Asian migrants' employment opportunities and they may then settle for low-skilled service positions and jobs in construction and transportation^{14,15}. Limited access to healthcare is one of the major structural barriers that Central Asian labour migrants face in Russia. Labour migrants, as opposed to citizens and permanent residents, in Russia are not eligible for state-sponsored compulsory insurance, OMS (Obyazatelnoye Meditsinskoye Strakhovaniye). Without the state-sponsored OMS, the health care choices of Central Asian labour migrants are limited to emergency care, paid services at state clinics as well as informal payments to doctors, and expensive private healthcare facilities¹⁶. Lack of insurance and high costs relative to income are barriers to getting adequate health care for Central Asian labour migrants, which is raises concerns for how this population will be affected by the COVID-19 epidemic in Russia.

RISKS FOR CENTRAL ASIAN LABOUR MIGRANTS IN RUSSIA DURING THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC

Russia currently has the third highest number of COVID-19 cases in the world, after the United States and Brazil¹⁷. There are over 560,000 official cases of COVID-19 in the Russian Federation to date and more than 7,600 deaths¹⁸. The majority of the cases are in Moscow, but there are documented cases across the country¹⁹. The Russian government has an official website dedicated to COVID-19 with extensive information about opportunities for testing, information about free medical care for COVID-19 patients, prevention measures, information for Russian citizens stranded abroad, stimulus payments for medical care workers, and social policy measures such as financial support for small businesses, pensioners, and families with children²⁰. There is no official systematic collection of data available on COVID-19 infections or mortality specifically among migrants. Based on the aforementioned legal, economic, and social vulnerabilities experienced by Central Asian labour migrants in Russia, we

¹ University of Michigan, School of Public Health [E: <u>eiking@umich.edu</u>]

² Ohio State University, Department of Anthropology [E: <u>zotova.1@buckeyemail.osu.edu</u>]

should assume that their risks for COVID-19 are as high, if not higher, than among Russian citizens. In fact, several outbreaks amongst this migrant population have been reported in the popular press²¹. Most alarming in regard to risk for infection of and complications from COVID-19 is that Central Asian labour migrants experience major institutional barriers, including discrimination to getting tested for the virus and to medical care to manage the symptoms²².

- On 31 January 2020, the Russian government added COVID-19 to the list of 'dangerous diseases' for which a positive diagnosis is cause for deportation of foreigners²³. Since this contentious pre-existing policy violate migrants' rights and has served as a barrier for HIV testing we therefore assume that the policy will have negative implications for Central Asian migrants' access to testing and medical care for COVID-19, and could lead to fear of reporting suspected cases.
- Lack of medical insurance is another major concern in Central Asian labour migrants' COVID-19 risk. OMS (the obligatory medical insurance policy) would cover the costs of a test and hospitalization for COVID-19 patients, yet citizens of Tajikistan and Uzbekistan are not eligible for OMS. Since 2017, citizens of the Eurasian Union countries (which include Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan) are eligible for OMS when residing in Russia; however, many labour migrants have not obtained this insurance for various reasons, including lack of awareness of the updated policy and difficulties in navigating Russian bureaucracy²⁴.
- Existing research has shown that the cost of medical diagnostic and treatment services is one of the most significant barriers for Central Asian labour migrants' utilization of health services while in Russia²⁵. Paying for a COVID-19 test is likely not an option for many labour migrants, and the costs associated with extended hospitalization are even more concerning.

The economic hardships due to the COVID-19 pandemic, and the now extensive period of society's lockdown, have hit Russia hard, and Central Asian labour migrants – already in very precarious financial situations, for instance living pay cheque to pay cheque and sending a significant portion of their salaries back home – are particularly vulnerable.

- In March, Russia's prime minister ordered the closing of all restaurants and catering facilities, except for delivery and takeout²⁶, affecting large numbers of Central Asian labour migrants, who work in the food service sector.
- Furthermore, since Central Asian labour migrants, in particular in service jobs, are subject to poor work conditions and treatment from their employers²⁷, those who continue to work will likely have no protection from, and therefore increased exposure to, the virus²⁸.
- For the many labour migrants that are now without work, basic survival is at stake; food and housing insecurity have been widely reported, with some reports of evictions as they could not pay rent^{29,30}. There have been reports of Central Asian labour migrants who have committed suicide because of the desperate situation they have found themselves in ³¹.
- Overcrowded and poor sanitation and housing conditions are likely to exacerbate the risk of infection for Central Asian labour migrants^{32,33,34} and people have been unable to effectively quarantine if they have fallen ill with COVID-19 symptoms³⁵.
- Unfortunately, there have been media reports of Central Asians stealing food or robbing people³⁶. It will be important to monitor the situation so that these types of reports do not fuel the xenophobia and discrimination that is common in Russia.
- The World Bank projects grave consequences for global remittances because of the pandemic: Europe and Central Asia will be hardest hit and Central Asian countries dependent on these remittances should expect to see a 28% decrease in remittances in 2020³⁷. The COVID-19 pandemic will have long lasting impact not only on the Central Asians working in Russia, but also on their family members back home who rely on these remittances.

Another significant concern is how measures to stop population movement and border control have resulted in the poor treatment of Central Asian labour migrants and placing them at increased risk from COVID-19. When Russia and Central Asian countries announced external borders closures, hundreds of Central Asian migrants tying to return to their home countries were stuck in transit zones at airports and in transit cities^{38,39,40} with many left to sleep on the floor in crowded areas and with little

access to food⁴¹. Additional, there are Central Asians (and other foreigners) who are now facing indefinite detention in temporary detainment centers for foreigners⁴².

RESPONSE TO COVID-19 AND CENTRAL ASIAN LABOUR MIGRANTS IN RUSSIA

- On April 18 2020, President Putin signed an executive order⁴³, which automatically extended the legal length of stay in the country for all foreigners in Russia up to 15th June, extending the validity of migration documents and removing work permit requirements, including the cost for these work permits between 15th March and 15th June. This executive order also included the suspension of deportations and court hearings on the breaches of immigration laws during this period. On June 15 2020, this executive order was updated to extend the date to 15th September⁴⁴.
 - The Russian border remains effectively closed and even transportation options out are almost nonexistent. Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan closed their borders in March and all three countries tried to organize some charter flights for their citizens^{45,46,47,48}. However, there are still many migrants stranded and waiting for transportation home^{49,50} with tens of thousands of Central Asian migrants declaring that they want to return home and even attempting to relocate to Russian cities that border Kazakhstan with hopes of passing through land borders⁵¹. The consulates in Russia have opened hotlines for their citizens and Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan have committed to providing financial aid to citizens in need⁵². For example, the Uzbekistan Embassy in Moscow will provide 12,130 rubles to migrants with disabilities, pregnant women and women with small children, students, and individuals with COVID-19⁵³.
- Civil society organizations with already limited funds have tried to respond to the immediate needs of Central Asian labour migrants stranded in Russia without jobs and resources. This includes organizations operating within Russia, such as Civic Assistance and Sakhovat⁵⁴; as well as Central Asian diaspora communities with online fundraising campaigns.
- The mayor of Moscow has stated that migrants should have access to testing and medical care⁵⁵.
- There are a lack of data on number of infections and access to medical treatment. While there have been some important policy-level responses, there is overall a lack of adequate response to protecting Central Asian labour migrants from COVID-19 and the economic vulnerabilities associated with the pandemic.

RECOMMENDATIONS TO ADDRESS COVID-19 RISK AND RESPONSE AMONG CENTRAL ASIAN LABOUR MIGRANTS IN RUSSIA

Following the Lancet Migration Global Call to Action⁵⁶, we propose several recommendations to ensure a COVID-19 response that is inclusive of Central Asian labour migrants in Russia:

R1. There is an immediate need to ensure **access to free COVID-19 testing and treatment to all labour migrants**, irrespective of their OMS insurance status. This information needs to then be effectively communicated to the migrant populations.

R2. Central Asian countries should coordinate with the Russian government to facilitate the **urgent repatriation of their citizens who want to return home from Russia**. This must be done immediately in order to limit the possible spread of the virus from Russia, and Central Asian countries and necessary measures should be implemented to ensure that those returning quarantine themselves upon arrival. R3. Central Asian countries should coordinate with Russia to provide **financial support to citizens stranded abroad, and Russia must also commit to providing basic necessities**, such as food, water, housing, and healthcare, to labour migrants who are experiencing heightened vulnerabilities due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

R4. Migrants who are awaiting departure should be **provided with food, water and safe and dignified accommodation** that does not place them at heightened risk for COVID-19 infection until they can safely return to their home country.

R5. It is critical that Central Asian labour migrants are **included in the Russian government's COVID19 prevention, testing and treatment strategies**. For example, the Russian government should ensure that public health information relating to COVID-19 is translated into all necessary languages and is culturally sensitive and accessible for Central Asians.

R6. The Russian government should continue to extend the expiration dates of visa registrations and work permits for foreign citizens until the pandemic is fully under control and travel is safe for everyone. After the expiration date there should be time for labour migrants to have financial and time resources to re-establish the validity of their work permits. This information must be effectively communicated to labour migrants to ensure that they are aware of their rights and to mitigate the chances that they will be exploited.

R7. The Russian government must immediately begin to **collect data on COVID-19 incidence**, **hospitalizations**, **mortality rates**, **and recovery rates among Central Asian labour migrants** in Russia and guarantee that this information will be used solely for public health purposes.

R8. Efforts must be made to **prevent stigmatisation**, **discrimination and xenophobia of migrants**, and actively counter the narrative that portrays Central Asian migrants as spreading the virus, which is likely to lead to further discrimination and stigmatisation and prevent reporting of COVID19 cases amongst migrant communities. Cases of xenophobia and discrimination must be documented and addressed by the relevant authorities.

ORGANISATIONS AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This situational brief was authored by Elizabeth J. King, PhD, MPH³ and Natalia Zotova, PhD⁴ and expert reviewed by Bernd Rechel, PhD⁵. Overall direction and review on behalf of the Lancet Migration global collaboration was provided by Miriam Orcutt and editorial review by Sophie McCann. This brief represents the views of the authors. This series of situational and policy briefs summarises key aspects of the COVID-19 response in relation to migrants and refugees at country or regional level. They include public health and policy recommendations and perspectives and build on the Lancet Migration Global Statement recommendations to ensure migrants and refugees: have access to healthcare; are included in prevention, preparedness and response; and are part of responsible and transparent public information strategies, during the COVID-19 pandemic. They are intended to be short briefs providing key information on particular migrant and refugee contexts and thematics, rather than fully comprehensive country or regional overviews. Situational briefs have been authored by experts working in academia, operational, or clinical areas of migration and COVID-19, and are hosted on the Lancet Migration website (www.migrationandhealth.org). They are up to date at the time of writing. Lancet Migration is a global collaboration between *The Lancet* and researchers, implementers, and others in the field of migration and health that aims to address evidence gaps and drive policy change building on the recommendations of the UCL-*Lancet* Commission on Migration and Health published in December 2018.

REFERENCES

² McAuliffe, M. and Khadria, B. 2020

⁹ Demintseva, E. & Kashnitskiy, D. (2016). Contextualizing migrants' strategies of seeking medical care in Russia. *International Migration*, 54(5), 29-42.

¹ McAuliffe, M. and Khadria, B. (Eds.) (2020). World Migration Report 2020. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.

³ Hoffman, E.T. (2017). Who goes to Russia? Understanding gendered migration patterns. *Eurasian Geography and Economics*, 58(1), 1–22. / Agadjanian, V. & Yoo, S.H. (2018). Migration, legality, and fertility regulation: abortion and contraception among migrants and natives in Russia. *Demographic Research*, 38, 1277-1302.

⁴ Kornienko, O., Agadjanian, V., Menjívar, C., & Zotova, N. (2018). Financial and emotional support in close personal ties among Central Asian migrant women in Russia. *Social Networks*, 53, 125-135.

⁵ Abashin, S. (2017). Migration policies in Russia: Laws and debates. In Heusala, A.-L., Aitamurto, K. (Eds.), Migrant workers in *Russia: Global challenges* of the shadow economy in societal transformation (pp. 16-34). Routledge: London and New York.

⁶ Schenk, C. (2018). Why control immigration? Strategic uses of migration management in Russia. University of Toronto Press, Toronto.

⁷ Gorina, E., Agadjanian, V., & Zotova, N. (2018). Migrant women's economic success in Russia: objective reality and subjective assessment. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 44(9), 1584-1603./ Agadjanian, V. & Yoo, S.H. (2018). Migration, legality, and fertility regulation: abortion and contraception among migrants and natives in Russia. *Demographic Research*, 38, 1277-1302.

⁸ Davé, B. (2014). Becoming "legal" through "illegal" procedures: The precarious status of migrant workers in Russia. *Russian Analytical Digest*, 159, 2-8.

³ University of Michigan, School of Public Health [E: <u>eiking@umich.edu</u>]

⁴ Ohio State University, Department of Anthropology [E: <u>zotova.1@buckeyemail.osu.edu</u>]

⁵ European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, UK

¹⁰ Agadjanian, V., Menjívar, C., & Zotova, N. (2017). Legality, racialization, and immigrants' experience of ethnoracial harassment in Russia. *Social Problems*, 64, 558-76.

¹¹ Kuznetsova, I. & Round, J. (2019). Postcolonial migrations in Russia: the racism, informality and discrimination nexus. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 39(1/2), 52-67.

¹² Agadjanian, V. & Yoo, S.H. (2018). Migration, legality, and fertility regulation: abortion and contraception among migrants and natives in Russia. *Demographic Research*, 38, 1277-1302.

¹³ King, E., Dudina, V., and Dubrovskaya, S. (2020) 'You feel sick, you get sick, you still keep going': Central Asian female labour migrants' health in Russia. *Global Public Health*, 15(4), 544-557.

¹⁴ Gorina, E., Agadjanian, V., & Zotova 2018. Gorina, E., Agadjanian, V., & Zotova, N. (2018). Migrant women's economic success in Russia: objective reality and subjective assessment. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 44(9), 1584-1603?

¹⁵ King, E.J. & Dudina, V.I. (2019). The Health Needs of Female Labor Migrants from Central Asia in Russia. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 21, 1406–1415.

¹⁶ Kashnitskiy, D. & Demintseva, E. (2018). 'Kyrgyz clinics' in Moscow: medical centers for Central Asian migrants. *Medical Anthropology*, 37(5), 401-411.

¹⁷ COVID-19 Dashboard by the Center for Systems Science and Engineering(CSSE) at Johns Hopkins University (JHU) <u>https://www.arcgis.com/apps/opsdashboard/index.html#/bda7594740fd40299423467b48e9ecf6</u>

¹⁸ Government of the Russian Federation. Official information about Coronavirus in Russia. https://Стопкоронавирус.рф

¹⁹ COVID-19 Dashboard by the CSSE at JHU

²⁰ Government of the Russian Federation. Official information about Coronavirus in Russia. https://Стопкоронавирус.рф

²¹ <u>https://lenta.ru/news/2020/04/15/sto_migrantov/</u>

²² https://fergana.news/articles/117247/, https://rus.azattyq.org/a/migrant-laborers-coronavirus/30558831.html

23 .http://government.ru/docs/38904/

²⁴ Kashnitskiy & Demintseva 2018.

²⁵ King, Dudina, & Dubrovskaya 2020.

²⁶ <u>http://government.ru/orders/selection/401/39288/</u>

²⁷ Gorina, Agadjanian, & Zotova 2018.

²⁸ <u>https://rus.azattyq.org/a/migrant-laborers-coronavirus/30558831.html</u>

²⁹ https://www.bbc.com/russian/av/media-52488601

³⁰ https://moslenta.ru/city/golod-krazhi-i-samoubiistva-do-chego-dovel-migrantov-koronavirus.htm

- ³¹ https://moslenta.ru/city/golod-krazhi-i-samoubiistva-do-chego-dovel-migrantov-koronavirus.htm
- ³² https://rus.azattyq.org/a/migrant-laborers-coronavirus/30558831.html
- ³³ <u>https://lenta.ru/news/2020/04/15/sto_migrantov/</u>

³⁴ http://19rus.info/index.php/vlast-i-politika/item/126247-covid-19-v-rossii-nashlas-skrytaya-ugroza

³⁵ https://m.47news.ru/articles/174291/?fbclid=IwAR2Bw6HCIPoS4NNSUYIyG4CnDc78O-rHalrMdI-KCyoys3dLbt6tXgpgV7A

³⁶ <u>https://ura.news/articles/1036280109</u>

³⁷ https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2020/04/22/world-bank-predicts-sharpest-decline-of-remittances-in-recent-

history?cid=SHR_SitesShareFB_EN_EXT&fbclid=IwAR2HEF5d_AUIGGYI_28gMP9yu5DVmCISqfn-T9IT2Bjms5B6laiDGens7cg

³⁸ <u>https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/04/16/russia-pandemic-grows-migration-detention-deadlock</u>

³⁹ //fergana.news/articles/116309/

⁴⁰ <u>https://novayagazeta.ru/articles/2020/05/03/85199-veleli-ne-zaderzhivat?utm_source=fb&utm_medium=novaya&utm_campaign=vydvoreniya-na-rodinu-v-spetspriemnike-dlya</u>

⁴¹ <u>https://cabar.asia/ru/rodina-ne-mozhet-pomoch-tysyachi-vyhodtsev-iz-stran-tsa-iz-za-koronavirusa-zastryali-za-rubezhom/</u>

⁴² https://zona.media/article/2020/04/02/ZVSIG

⁴³ <u>http://kremlin.ru/events/president/news/63216</u>

⁴⁴<u>http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/0001202006150016</u>

⁴⁵ https://24.kg/obschestvo/151941_vsol-iletske_ostalis_70grajdan_kyirgyizstana_nesoglasilis_brosat_mashinyi/

⁴⁶ <u>https://for.kg/news-647443-ru.html,</u>

⁴⁷ <u>https://kun.uz/ru/news/2020/05/13/charternyye-reysy-i-sudba-nashix-sootechestvennikov-ostavshixsya-na-granitse-bez-deneg-intervyu-s-otvetstvennym-sotrudnikom-mintransa</u>

⁴⁸ <u>https://fergana.media/news/118032/</u>

⁴⁹ https://fergana.news/news/117589/

⁵⁰ <u>https://cabar.asia/ru/rodina-ne-mozhet-pomoch-tysyachi-vyhodtsev-iz-stran-tsa-iz-za-koronavirusa-zastryali-za-rubezhom/</u>
⁵¹ <u>https://migranty.org/novosti/bez-rubriki/v-otchajanii-i-bez-deneg-tjagoty-trudovyh-migrantov-iz-centralnoj-azii/</u>

⁵²https://24.kg/obschestvo/152219 vmoskve sozdan shtab vzaschitu sootechestvennikov okazavshihsya vtrudnoy situatsii /

53 https://fergana.media/news/118065/

⁵⁴ https://kun.uz/en/news/2020/04/16/sakhovat-center-established-to-assist-uzbek-citizens-residing-in-russia

⁵⁵ <u>https://www.interfax.ru/moscow/706926</u>

⁵⁶ Lancet Migration Global Statement, Leaving no one behind in the Covid-19 Pandemic: a call for urgent global action to include migrants & refugees in the Covid-19 response, April 10th 2020, <u>https://www.migrationandhealth.org/statements</u>