REVIEW ON INCLUSION OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES AND THE IMPACT OF VISION 2020 UMURENGE PROGRAMME (VUP) ON PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES.

November 2017

I. Table of Contents

1.1. 7	Fable of Contents	2
II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		3
1.	Introduction and Background	7
2.	Overview of Persons with Disabilities in Rwanda	8
3.	Legal Framework	9
4.	Policies framework	11
5.	Strategies	12
6.	Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme	13
7.	Recommendations	18

II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Government of Rwanda (GOR) has made substantial progress in reducing poverty in Rwanda. This qualitative report draws primarily from information gathered through a desk review of existing publications including laws, policies, conventions, study reports. Rwanda has adopted various policies, laws, strategies and programmes which directly or indirectly deal with the inclusion of Persons with disabilities.

This report identifies and analyses policies and laws which currently include of Persons with disabilities in social protection specifically the Vision 2020 *Umurenge* Programme and considers some of the gaps in the VUP norms which prevent the successful inclusion of Persons with Disabilities.

Key findings

As far as the legal framework is concerned, the Government of Rwanda has enacted the following laws and ministerial which have either a direct or indirect positive impact on the rights of persons with disabilities:

- The Constitution of Rwanda of 2003 as revised in 2015
- The Law N°02/2007 of 20/01/2007 relating to the protection of disabled former war combatants
- The Law N° 01/2007 of 20/01/2007 relating to protection of Disabled Persons Law on the protection of disabled former war combatants
- The Ministerial order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determining modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.
- The Ministerial Order N°20/19 of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities access medical care

There is no specific policy on persons with disabilities. However the following policies which have a direct or indirect impact on the rights of persons with disabilities:

- The National Social Protection Policy (2005)
- The National Employment Policy

The Government of Rwanda has adopted the following strategies which have either a direct or indirect impact on the rights of persons with disabilities:

- The National Social Protection Strategy
- The Economic Development and Poverty reduction Strategy II

The Government of Rwanda has adopted the following programmes which have a significant impact on the rights of the persons with disabilities:

- Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme
- Girinka

Lastly, the Government of Rwanda has adopted the following guidelines which have either a direct or indirect impact on the rights of persons with disabilities:

- Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP): Direct Support Guidelines
- Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme : Classic Public Works Guidelines
- Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme :Expanded Public Works Guidelines

As far as the inclusion of persons with disabilities in poverty reduction, this report has identified the following gaps:

- There is no link between VUP Direct Support Guidelines and the Ministerial order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.
- No provision of quotas for Persons with disabilities under the Guidelines for VUP Public Works Low level of participation in VUP Public Works by persons with disabilities.
- Lack of statistics on tangible impact of participation in Public Works by persons with disability or household head of person with a disability.

Key Recommendations

With regard to VUP Direct Support:

- The Government of Rwanda could replicate a good practice from Botswana. Botswana has identified an inability to work due to a disability as a specific eligibility criterion for receipt of mainstream cash transfers.
- Review the VUP Direct Support Guidelines with the view of ensuring that they set means test as per the Ministerial order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to

classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.

With regard to VUP Public Works:

- The Ministry of Local Government, the Ministry of Infrastructure and the Ministry of Labour and Public Service and Persons with Disability Organizations should jointly conduct of a countrywide needs assessment /baseline survey with the view of understanding the barriers to participation of Persons with disabilities both in terms of access and attitudes to public works programmes.
- The Ministry of Local Government and LODA need to ensure that VUP Public works accommodate the needs of persons with disabilities at workplace. In 2007, the South African Department of Public Service and Administration, the equivalent of the Ministry of Public Service and Labour in Rwanda, developed a Handbook on reasonable accommodation for people with disabilities in the Public Service. The Handbook suggests forms and reasonable measures for different categories of people with disabilities such as hearing impaired, visually impaired, mobility impaired and intellectual and psychological disabilities. This is a good practice that could be replicated in Rwanda.
- LODA needs to review the guidelines for VUP Public Works with the view of having quota for persons with disabilities as an affirmative action to increase the number of persons with disabilities participating in the VUP Public Works. The Government of Rwanda could replicate a good practice from India in terms of quota reservation scheme for VUP public works. The Government of India has reserved 3 % of vacancies against identified posts for people with disabilities in Central Government ministries, public sector undertaking and banks.
- The National Commission for Human Rights should monitor the implementation of VUP with a focus on the rights of persons with disabilities.
- LODA needs to consult with the National Council of Persons with Disabilities (NCPD), people with a disability and Disability rights organizations at key stages of any VUP Public work projects design and evaluation.
- There is a need for the Rwanda Civil Society Platform increased involvement in monitoring the implementation of VUP.

- Conduct of a countrywide needs assessment /baseline survey with the view of understanding the barriers which prevent Persons with disabilities from being in involved public works programmes.
- LODA should ensure that systematic and disaggregated data collection take into consideration disability when monitoring the implementation of VUP.
- Review the guidelines for VUP Public Works with the view of having quota for persons with disabilities as an affirmative action to increase the number of persons with disabilities participating in the VUP Public Works.
- VUP Public Works must align with article 3 (2) of the Ministerial order n° 03/19.19 of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities to easily access employment provides that in of offering non-competitive employment, when a person with disability has the same capacity as a nondisabled person, the person with disability should be accorded priority consideration for employment.
- LODA needs to consult with people with a disability and Disability rights organizations at key stages of any VUP Public work project design and evaluation.
- NUDOR should consider using the National Dialogue "*Umushyikirano*" as a forum to air some of the concerns affecting persons with disabilities in Rwanda in the implementation of VUP.

The successful inclusion of Persons with disabilities requires a holistic approach that takes into considerations such as stigma and discrimination among obstacles which need to be addressed. As general recommendations, attention must be paid to the following:

- There is a need to develop a joint advocacy mechanism on the rights of persons with disabilities in Rwanda. The National Commission for Human Rights, the National Council of Persons with Disability and Persons with Disabilities Organisations should take the lead in the development and implementation of the advocacy mechanism.
- The National Council of Persons with Disabilities should engage with district officials with the view of ensuring that district plan of actions as well as development initiatives take into consideration the needs of persons with disabilities.
- The National Council of Persons with Disabilities should play a key role in making a follow up on the implementation of the three components of VUP.

1. Introduction and Background

1.1. Background

The National Union of Disability Organisations in Rwanda (NUDOR) exists to strengthen the voice of the disability movement in Rwanda. It is an umbrella organisation established in 2010 by eight organisations of persons with disabilities. Together NUDOR and its twelve members are working so that persons with disabilities can enjoy the equal rights to which they are entitled. The mission of NUDOR is to serve as a voice for organizations of persons with disabilities to express their views and to support them in strengthening their capacities and achievements.

There is no dispute that the Government of Rwanda has made substantive progress in terms of poverty reduction in the last 23 years. Findings from Rwanda Poverty Profile revealed that poverty has reduced from 44.9% in 2011 to 39.1% in 2014 and extreme poverty from 24.1% to 16.3%.¹

Poverty reduction has been attributed to the development and implementation of various programmes and strategies including the Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategies (One and Two), the Social Protection Strategy, *Girinka* to name a few.

One of the remaining challenges is that there is still a lot of soft stigmatization and discrimination against the rights of PWDs in design and implementation of government policies and development programmes.

Most importantly, the situation of disability-disaggregated data is unknown first to help understand the extent to which the government policies and programmes are inclusive in their implementation but also to facilitate Civil Society Organisations to engage in evidence-based advocacy to influence inclusive policies and government behaviors and practices.

- *1.2. Objectives of the assignment*
- 1.2.1. Main objective

The main objective of the assignment was to review all reports and all relevant documents and document to what extent is VUP inclusive to Persons with Disabilities and how it has impacted the lives of Persons with Disabilities in reality

1.2.2. Specific objectives

The specific objectives of the desk review were to:

¹National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Rwanda Poverty Profile Report, 2013/14, (August 2015)

- Identify and describe the experiences of PWDs in the various components of VUP as it evolves.
- Identify any documented lessons learned, best practices of inclusiveness of PWDs
- Identify any documented impact and benefits to the PWDs attributed to their involvement in VUP programmes
- Identify the role of different actors in the implementation of VUP programme and their level of interaction with Disabilities Peoples' Organisations (DPOs)

1.3. Methodology

The analysis was mainly a desk review. The assignment analyzed laws, policies, programmes and various reports.

2. Overview of Persons with Disabilities in Rwanda

2.1. Population size

According to the latest population census, 446,453 persons with disabilities aged 5 and above are living in Rwanda out of which 221,150 are male and 225,303 are female.²

2.2. Disability and labour

The labour force participation rate of persons with disabilities is, at 56%, lower than that of the population without a disability $(75\%)^3$. In addition, 69% of households headed by persons with a disability use an improved water source against 73% among households headed by persons without a disability.⁴

2.3. Disability and poverty

²National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MINECOFIN) [RWANDA] 2012. Rwanda Fourth Population and Housing Census. Thematic Report: Socio-economic characteristics of persons with disabilities

³ National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MINECOFIN) [RWANDA] 2012.*Rwanda Fourth Population and Housing Census. Thematic Report: Socio-economic characteristics of persons with disabilities*

⁴National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MINECOFIN) [RWANDA] 2012. *Rwanda Fourth Population and Housing Census. Thematic Report: Socio-economic characteristics of persons with disabilities*

Findings from various pieces of research showed the strong correlation between disability and poverty with poverty leading to higher rates of disability and disability increasing the risk of poverty.⁵Also literature review has also suggested that poverty is a consequence of disability since people with disabilities often lack access to education, health services and incomegenerating activities.⁶Findings from 14 household surveys in 13 developing countries found that adults with disabilities as a group were poorer than average households.⁷

Finally, it has rightly been argued that persons with disabilities are also economically worse off and at greater risk of poverty than non-disabled persons, in particular where they are not provided with adequate social protection.⁸

3. Legal Framework

The right to social protection is provided under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and other Rwandan Laws.

3.1. International legal framework

Rwanda has ratified the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disability and thus has obligations in terms of compliance with the Conventions.⁹Article 28 (2) (b) of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities obliges states Parties to ensure access by persons with disabilities, in particular women and girls with disabilities and older persons with disabilities, to social protection programmes and poverty reduction programmes. It is worth mentioning that article 168 of the Constitution of Rwanda of 2003 as revised in 2015 provides that upon publication in the Official Gazette, international treaties and agreements which have been duly ratified or approved have the force of law as national legislation in accordance with the hierarchy of laws provided for under the first paragraph of Article 95 of this Constitution.

https://www.cbm.org/article/downloads/78851/CBM_Disability_Inclusion_-Livelihood.pdf>> .Accessed on 18 October 2017. Read also Handicap-International *Good practices for the Economic Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Developing Countries*. Retrieved from <<<u>http://www.handicap-</u> international.org/uploads/media/goodpractices-GB-2coul.PDF>> Accessed on 25 October 2017

⁵Read, Disability Inclusion: Livelihood <<

⁶UNDP *Livelihood opportunities for people with disabilities*. Retrieved from << http://www.undp.org/content/dam/india/docs/pub-povertyreduction/livelihood-opportunities-for-persons-with-disabilities.pdf>>>. Accessed on 25 October 2017

⁷ UNICEF World Report on Disability. Retrieved from <<

https://www.unicef.org/protection/World_report_on_disability_eng.pdf>> Accessed on 25 October 2017 ⁸ UNICEF World Report on Disability Idem

⁹ Rwanda ratified the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disability on 15 December 2008.

In light of the above, article 28 of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disability is applicable in Rwanda.

3.2. National legal framework

With regard to the Constitution of 2003 as revised in 2015, it is worth noting that article 51 (2) of the Constitution of 2003 as revised in 2015 provides that the State has the duty ,within its means, to undertake special actions aimed at the welfare of persons with disabilities. In addition, article 17 (1) of the law on the protection of disabled former war combatants provides for a Presidential Order that should determine a monthly subsistence allowance to a needy disabled war combatant.¹⁰

Article 3 of the Law on the rights of persons with disability reads:" Every disabled person should be entitled to equal rights with others persons before the law. He or she should be respected and be entitled to human dignity."¹¹

Besides the above provisions which guarantee the rights of persons with disabilities to social protection. There are also other provisions which prohibit discrimination on the basis of disability. The prohibition of discrimination is very relevant as far as access to social protection or employment is concerned.

Indeed, article16 (2) of Constitution of 2003 as revised in 2015 reads as follows: "Discrimination of any kind or its propaganda based on, inter alia, ethnic origin, family or ancestry, clan, skin colour or race, sex, region, economic categories, religion or faith, opinion, fortune, cultural differences, language, economic status, *physical or mental disability* or any other form of discrimination are prohibited and punishable by law." (Emphasis added).

In addition, article18 of the law relating to the protection of disabled persons reads as follows:

"No discrimination of any form should be subjected upon a disabled person in matters related to employment. However, a disabled person should be given greater access to employment opportunities than any other citizen in case of equal capacities or in case of equal marks in competition."

 $^{^{10}}$ This Law is officially known as Law N°02/2007 of 20/01/2007 relating to the protection of disabled former war combatants

¹¹This Law is officially known as Law N° 01/2007 of 20/01/2007 relating to protection of Disabled Persons in general

Furthermore, article 14 of the law on the protection of disabled former war combatants provides that the disabled war combatant should be given greater access to job opportunities in case of equal capacity or equal marks in competition. With regard to employment, it should also be mentioned that article 3 of the Ministerial order n° 03/19.19 of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities to easily access employment which provides as follows: "With respect to offering competitive employment, where a person with disability has the same results as that of a non-disabled person after competition, the person with disability should be accorded priority consideration for employment.

With respect to offering non-competitive employment, when a person with disability has the same capacity as a nondisabled person, the person with disability should be accorded priority consideration for employment.

No person should deny employment to a person with disability or dismiss him/her on grounds of disability."

It is worth mentioning that article 2 (1) of the Ministerial Order N°20/19 of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities access medical care provides that persons with disabilities whose degree of disability is between 50% and 100% should be the responsibility of the State as regards to the mutual health insurance scheme while those whose degree of disability is between 30% and 49% should be the responsibility of the State at 50% in respect of mutual health insurance premiums.

Finally , it should be noted that article 2(2) of the Ministerial Order N°20/19 of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities access medical care provides as follows: "In respect of contributions of persons with disability to medical care and purchase of drugs, the care of those whose degree of disability is between 50% and 100% should be the responsibility of the State while those whose degree of disability is between 30% and 49% and are needy should also be the responsibility of the State. "

4. Policies framework

There is no specific policy on the rights of the People with Disabilities in Rwanda. Nevertheless there are policies which address either directly or indirectly the needs of People with disability.

4.1. *Social Protection Policy.*¹²

The objective of social protection policy is to reduce vulnerability in general, and vulnerability of the poor and marginalized people, in particular; to promote sustainable economic and social development by the reduction of social risk and coordination of saving activities; and the protection of vulnerable groups in the short, medium and long terms.

4.2. *National Employment Policy*.¹³

One of the long term objectives of the National Employment Policy is to promote the employment of youth, women, persons with disability, the marginalized and increasing their contribution to economic production. In addition, the National Employment Policy states that it intends to establish incentive measures to encourage persons with disability to form associations and initiate income generating activities.

5. Strategies

The Government of Rwanda has developed various strategies which have either a direct or indirect impact on the livelihood of persons with disabilities.

5.1. *The National Social Protection Strategy.*¹⁴

The National Social Protection Strategy defines social protection across two main dimensions on one hand as a social protection sector, which essentially comprises the system of regular and predicable cash transfers that provides income support to those living in poverty and vulnerable to falling into poverty and on the other hand as a means of ensuring access to other public services – such as health and education – by enabling poor households to overcome the financial barriers that they may face.

The overall goal of the National Social Protection Strategy is to build a social protection system that tackles poverty and inequality, enables the poor to move out of poverty, helps reduce

¹²Ministry of Local Government National Social Protection Policy (2005)

¹³Ministry of Public Service and LabourNational Employment Policy (2007)

¹⁴Ministry of Local Government *NationalSocial Protection Strategy*(2011).

vulnerability and protect people from shocks, helps improve health and education among all Rwandans, and contributes to economic growth.

A desk review commissioned by NUDOR highlighted the delay in the implementation of the Ministerial Order on classification of disabilities as the distribution of cards with information category and degree started in 2016 whereas the Ministerial Order issued in 2009 provided that the classification exercise was supposed to start one year upon the publication of the Ministerial Order in the Official Gazette. The study also found out the delay in conducting the feasibility study on disability grant despite the fact that the National Social Protection Strategy had provided for it.

5.2. *The Economic Development and Poverty reduction Strategy* II (EDPRS 2).¹⁵

The EDPRS 2 states that Rwanda does not intend to leave any of its citizens behind in its development. The EDPRS 2 further states that specific steps will be taken to ensure that people with disabilities (PWDs) and other disadvantaged groups are able to contribute actively to the country's development and to benefit from it.

6. Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP).¹⁶

The Vision 2020 *Umurenge* Programme (VUP) aims to eradicate extreme poverty by 2020. This aim will eventually be achieved through acceleration in poverty reduction. The VUPhas three components namelydirect support, public worksand financial services.

6.1. Direct support

With regard to direct support component provides unconditional cash transfers to extremely poor households in the bottom two *Ubudehe's* category 1 and whose members are unable to work because of age, disability or illness and are without a household member qualifying for public works. This component aims to improve standards of living, access to essential social services such as education or health, and the ability of households to save and invest.

6.1.1. Eligibility criteria

¹⁵Ministry of Finance and Economic PlanningEconomic Development and Poverty Reduction II (2013-2018).

¹⁶Government of Rwanda Vision 2020 Umurenge: An Integrated Local Development Program to Accelerate Poverty Eradication, Rural Growth, and Social Protection.

The Local Administrative Entities Development Agency (LODA) issued guidelines which set the eligibility criteria for VUP direct support.¹⁷ According to these guidelines, households eligible for VUP must be classified in *Ubudehe* category 1 with no worker (no members of the household aged between 18 and 64 years who are able to work). The guidelines mention that individuals aged 18 years and above who are in full time education and people with severe disabilities and or serious chronic illnesses that prevent them from working should not be considered as able to work. From the above guidelines, it is clear that disability is not considered as a vulnerability criterion in Rwandan social protection programs if the person is not listed in the first or second *Ubudehe* categories 1 and 2.

As far as the eligibility criteria is concerned , it should be noted that the Ministerial Order $N^{\circ}20/19$ of 27/7/2009 determining the modalities of facilitating persons with disabilities access medical is more progressive than these guidelines as article 2 (1) of the Ministerial provides that persons with disabilities whose degree of disability is between 50% and 100% should be the responsibility of the State as regards to the mutual health insurance scheme while those whose degree of disability is between 30% and 49% should be the responsibility of the State at 50% in respect of mutual health insurance premiums. The eligibility to full or partial medical insurance is not based on *ubudehe* categories but rather on degree of disability.

6.1.2. Inclusion of persons with disabilities in the VUP Direct Support and its impact on Persons with disabilities

Findings from the Fourth Population and Housing Census revealed 50.2 % of Household containing member with disability participated in VUP Direct Support component.¹⁸The above figures have to be taken with caution as the census was conducted in 2012 whereas the guidelines were only adopted in 2017.

In addition, findings from the Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey (EICV) 2013/2014 showed that 37% of VUP Direct Support beneficiaries reported the transfer is used to support day-to-day consumption and basic needs such as food and clothing as their main use of

¹⁷Local Administrative Entities Development Agency Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP) : Direct Support Guidelines (2017). Document available at

<<<u>http://loda.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/documents/2014_PRO/Documents/DS_GUIDELINES_2017_ENGLIS</u> <u>H_VERSION.pdf</u>>>

the transfer. Further, 24% reported investing it in farming activities, while 18% reported having spent it on improving their home.¹⁹

6.1.3. Gaps:

 There is no link between VUP Direct Support Guidelines and the Ministerial order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determining modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.

The guidelines do not determine the severity of disability. The guidelines do not make any reference to the Ministerial Order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.

Article 2 of the Ministerial Order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disabilityreadas follows : "Disabled persons should be classified under the following categories:

- 1. Physically disabled persons;
- 2. Sight-impaired persons;
- 3. Deaf-and-dumb persons or persons with either of these disabilities;
- 4. Mentally disabled persons;

5. Persons with disabilities not specified in the above categories approved by the Medical committee.

Whereas article 3 of the Ministerial Order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability reads as follows : "On the basis of the degree of disability ascertained by the Medical Committee established by relevant authorities, persons with disabilities in each category of disability specified under paragraph 2 of are classified into the categories below in light of international disability standards:

1. between 90 and 100%;

¹⁹National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Social protection and VUP Report, 2013/14 (November 2015)

- 2. between 70 and 89%;
- 3. between 50 and 69%;
- 4. between 30 and 49%;
- 5. below 30%.

After classification into one of the different categories specified under Article 2 and 3 of this Order, the Medical committee should issue them a card that indicates the disability, degree of disability and the signature of the Medical Committee President."

• Inconsistent eligibility criterion for persons with disabilities: VUP direct support versus medical care.

The eligibility criterion for persons with disability in VUP Direct support is based on membership to *Ubudehe* category 1 and 2 whereas for medical care the eligibility is based on degree of disability.

Gaps:

6.2. *VUP Public works*

The VUP public work projects are selected and implemented by the sector administration according to local needs and in line with the sector level development plans. It must also be noted that in many sectors where the Public works component is formally active, there is insufficient work to reach all those that wish to undertake it.

6.2.1. Selection criteria for the inclusion in the VUP Public Works

The Local Administrative Entities Development Agency (LODA) issued guidelines which set the eligibility criteria for Classic Public Works²⁰ and the Expanded Public Works.²¹With regard to

²⁰Local Administrative Entities Development Agency Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP): Classic Public Works Guidelines (May 2017). Document available at

<<<u>http://loda.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/documents/2014_PRO/Documents/cPW_GUIDELINES_2017_ENGLI</u>
SH_VERSION.pdf>>

²¹Local Administrative Entities Development Agency Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP): Expanded Public Works Guidelines (May 2017). Document available at<<<u>http://loda.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/documents/2014_PRO/Documents/ePW_GUIDELINES_2017_ENGL_ISH_VERSION.pdf</u>>>

the Classic Public Works guidelines, the main criterion to be included in the classic public works is any household belonging to *Ubudehe* category 1 that has one member who can work. It is worth mentioning that the Guidelines for Expanded Public works state that in the event that the budget available is insufficient to provide employment to all eligible households in a sector, single worker households containing a person with disabilities or young persons should be given priority.

6.2.2. Inclusion of persons with disabilities in the VUP Public Works and its impact on Persons with disabilities

Findings from the Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey (EICV) 2013/2014 revealed that 3 % of Persons with disability eligible for VUP participated in VUP Public Works.²² *Gaps*

• Inexistence of quota schemes

While the VUP Classic Public Works Guidelines state that at least 50 % of households participating in the Classic Public Works project should be female headed households, the guidelines are silent on quota for persons from households headed with a person with disability who can work. The introduction of quotas scheme has been recognised as an affirmative action aimed at either promoting the inclusion or increase of the number of persons with disabilities in terms of employment.²³

• Low level of participation in VUP Public Works by persons with disabilities.

Findings from the Rwanda National Institute of Statistics report on Social Protection and VUP revealed that 3 % of Persons with disability eligible for VUP participated in VUP Public Works whereas 96.8 % of eligible persons with no disability participated in the VUP Public Works.²⁴ This is a very low percentage compared to persons without disability in terms of VUP Public Works. This could imply that the proposed types of VUP Public works did not take into challenge perceptions that persons with disabilities cannot be accommodated in the workplace or

 ²²National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Social protection and VUP Report,2013/14 (November 2015)
²³United Nations Toolkit on Disability in Africa: The Rights of Persons with Disabilities to Work. Available at << http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/documents/disability/Toolkit/Rights-Persons-with-DisabilitiestoWork.pdf>

Accessed on 12 November 2017. Read also Julian Cuppage *The World and Disability: Quotas or No Quotas?*. Available *at <<u>https://www.igloballaw.com/the-world-and-disability-quotas-or-no-quotas/</u>>>*. Accessed on 12 November 2017

²⁴National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), *Social protection and VUP Report*, 2013/14 (November 2015)

failed to identify and address travel barriers including terrain and public transport that may inhibit participation in livelihood activities. There is a need to conduct a comprehensive study to understand the root causes of low percentage of persons with disabilities in VUP Public works. Findings of the same report on social protection and VUP showed that only 5 % of household head with a disability participated in the VUP Public Works.²⁵

• Lack of statistics on tangible impact of participation in Public Works by persons with disability or household head of person with a disability.

6.3. Financial services or credit packages

This component of the VUP aims to tackle extreme poverty as well as to foster entrepreneurship and off-farm employment opportunities; these packages are designed to make the best possible use of scarce public resources, involve the private financial sector, and provide people with incentives to improve their own productive capacities.

Findings from the Rwanda National Institute of Statistics report on Social Protection and VUP showed that about 36% VUP beneficiaries were either participating or had previously done so.²⁶

6.4. Gap

• Lack of data on Persons with disabilities whose livelihood was improved by VUP Financial Services.

7. Recommendations

For the VUP to be more inclusive and more responsive to Persons with disabilities, the following actions need to be taken into consideration:

7.1. Direct support (cash transfer)

The Government of Rwanda should consider replicating the following good practice from other countries:

• Inclusion of inability to work due to disability as a criterion for direct support.

 ²⁵National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), *Social protection and VUP Report*,2013/14 (November 2015)
²⁶National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), Social protection and VUP Report,2013/14 (November 2015)

The Government of Rwanda could replicate a good practice from Botswana. Indeed, Botswana has identified an inability to work due to a disability as a specific eligibility criterion for receipt of mainstream cash transfers.²⁷ This should not be very difficult to replicate in Rwanda as the National Council of Persons with Disabilities (NCPD) has been distributing cards with degree of disability to persons with disabilities in Rwanda since 2016.²⁸

7.2. Public Works

- The Ministry of Local Government, the Ministry of Infrastructure and the Ministry of Labour and Public Service and Persons with Disability Organizations should jointly conduct of a countrywide needs assessment /baseline survey with the view of understanding the barriers to participation of Persons with disabilities both in terms of access and attitudes to public works programmes.
- The Ministry of Local Government and LODA need to ensure that VUP Public works accommodate the needs of persons with disabilities at workplace. In 2007, The South African Department of Public Service and Administration, the equivalent of the Ministry of Public Service and Labour in Rwanda, developed a Handbook on reasonable accommodation for people with disabilities in the Public Service. The Handbook suggests forms and reasonable measures for different categories of people with disabilities such as hearing impaired, visually impaired, mobility impaired and intellectual and psychological disabilities.²⁹ This is a good practice that could be replicated in Rwanda.
- LODA should review the guidelines for VUP Public Works with the view of having quota for persons with disabilities as an affirmative action to increase the number of persons with disabilities participating in the VUP Public Works.
- The Government of Rwanda could replicate a good practice from India in terms of quota reservation scheme for VUP public works. Indeed, the Government of India has reserved 3 % of vacancies against identified posts for people with disabilities in Central Government ministries, *public sector undertaking* and banks.³⁰(Emphasis added).

²⁷ Brigitte Rohwerder *Disability inclusion in social protection*. Retrieved from <<

http://www.usicd.org/doc/Disability%20inclusion%20in%20social%20protection%202014.pdf>.Accessed on 29 October 2017

²⁸ A study commissioned by NUDOR on Impact of social protection policy and programs on disability rights and action plan to make existing policy and programs disability friendly revealed the National Council of Persons with Disabilities has been distributing the cards since 2016.

²⁹ Document available at << <u>http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/documents/disability/Toolkit/Rights-Persons-with-DisabilitiestoWork.pdf</u>>> Accessed on 12 November 2017.

³⁰ Read Employment of Persons with Disabilities in Public Sectors in India Emerging Issues and Trends - An Evaluation Study with Special Reference to Persons with Disabilities Act (1995). Available at << <u>http://planningcommission.gov.in/reports/sereport/ser/ser_pdp1206.pdf</u>>> Accessed on 13 November 2017

• LODA needs to consult with people with a disability and Disability rights organizations at key stages of any VUP Public work projects design and evaluation.

7.3. Financial Services

- The Local Administrative Entities Development Agency (LODA) in partnership with the National Institute of Statistics need to assess the impact of VUP Financial Services on the livelihoods of people with disabilities. The partnership with Disability rights organisations and persons with disabilities will be very crucial in such exercise.
- LODA should review the VUP Direct Support Guidelines with the view of ensuring that they set means test as per the Ministerial order N° 20/18 of 27 July 2009 determines modalities to classify other Persons with Disabilities into categories according to their degree of disability.